10 years of research with the Borexino experiment

Gioacchino Ranucci

Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare Milano ICPPA 2017 Moscow

4-10-2017

One of the basic mankind's question: why does the Sun shine?

Ancient Greek's "chariot of the Sun" example of first developed "theories"

La Sala del Tiepolo in «palazzo Clerici» Milano



Turning point at the passage between 19th and 20th centuries

- In the 19th century hot controversy between Lord Kelvin and Darwin: age of he Earth and the Sun to account for the evolution of the life on our planet, incompatibility with the sources of energy known at that time
- Clue \rightarrow Aston experiment in 1920: m(He)<4 m(H)

• Eddington: argued in his 1920 presidential address to the British Association for the Advancement of Science that Aston's measurement meant that the Sun could shine by converting hydrogen atoms to helium....

Formulation of the nuclear hypothesis

"If, indeed, the sub-atomic energy in the stars is being freely used to maintain their great furnaces, it seems to bring a little nearer to fulfillment our dream of controlling this latent power for the wellbeing of the human race---or for its suicide" A. Eddington

1938 Von Weizsacker \rightarrow Identification of potential CNO cycle

1938 Bethe \rightarrow Identification of potential *p*-*p* chain and full definition of the nuclear hypothesis

How to prove it?

Hypothesis : there are nuclear reactions occurring in the core summarized as

$$4^{1}H \rightarrow {}^{4}He + 2e^{+} + 2v_{e} + energy$$

Can it be proved?



Yes, neutrinos coming from the reactions are the smoking gun! They pass undisturbed through the solar matter and if detected at Earth they would prove unambiguously the nuclear hypothesis; possibility debated in the context of the discussions about neutrino detection just after the world war II (Pontecorvo ⁴/₅47) From this trigger the Solar Neutrino Saga: the experimental players taking part to an almost five decades long successful

Radiochemical experiments:

- Homestake (Cl)
- Gallex/GNO (Ga)
- Sage (Ga)

Common

this

ingredient in

challenging

rare events

search \rightarrow

ultra-low

background

Real time Cherenkov experiments

- Kamiokande/Super-Kamiokande
- **SNO** (Heavy water)

Scintillator experiment

Borexino



Overall two major accomplishments:

- proof of the Nuclear hypothesis
- Through the identification and solution of the "solar neutrino problem" → contribution to the proof of neutrino oscillations -MSW effect: resonant neutrino flavor conversion in matter



Standard Solar Model vs Helioseismology



The prediction of solar v flux is sensitive to the Sun metallicity

	Flux	B16-GS98 HZ	B16-AGSS09met LZ	Be: 10 ⁹ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹ ; pep, N, O: 10 ⁸ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹ ;
	$\Phi(pp)$	$5.98(1 \pm 0.006)$	$6.03(1 \pm 0.005)$	B, F: 10 ⁶ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹ ; hen: 10 ³ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹
	$\Phi(\text{pep})$	$1.44(1 \pm 0.01)$	$1.46(1 \pm 0.009)$	hep. 10 cm 3
	$\Phi(hep)$	$7.98(1 \pm 0.30)$	$8.25(1 \pm 0.30)$	
	$\Phi(^7\text{Be})$	$4.93(1 \pm 0.06)$	$4.50(1 \pm 0.06)$	⁷ Be: 8.7% diff
	$\Phi(^{8}B)$	$5.46(1 \pm 0.12)$	$4.50(1 \pm 0.12)$	⁸ B: 17.6% diff
NT XC	$\Phi(^{13}N)$	$2.78(1 \pm 0.15)$	$2.04(1 \pm 0.14)$	
arXiv:1611.09867v4	$CNO \Phi(^{15}O)$	$2.05(1 \pm 0.17)$	$1.44(1 \pm 0.16)$	CNO: 40% diff
	$\Phi(^{17}\text{F})$	$5.29(1 \pm 0.20)$	$3.26(1 \pm 0.18)$	

The experimental measurement of the CNO flux is the clue towards the resolution of the metallicity puzzle

The ultimate frontier of the solar neutrino saga to understand the SUN

Other intriguing detected and potential effects make the field very vital and of persistent attraction also for the continued study of neutrino properties

G. Ranucci INFN Milano (Italy) ICPPA 2017 Moscow 4-10-2017

Units:

pp: 1010 cm-2 s-1;



Borexino

 Approaching the full solar neutrino spectroscopy in a single experiment through the individual real time detection of each spectral component - 4 out of 5 so far

 Unique Validation in the low energy regime of the LMA-MSW v oscillation paradigm through the experimental determination of the Pee



Borexino Collaboration





Borexino at Gran Sasso: low energy real time detection









В



Detection principle

$$v_x + e \rightarrow v_x + e$$

Elastic scattering off the electron of the scintillator threshold at ~ 60 keV (electron energy)

Capabilities of the experiment : (in read tasks already accomplished)

```
<sup>7</sup>Be flux (862 keV),
<sup>8</sup>B with a lower threshold down to 3 MeV,
pep (1.44 MeV) coupled to a tight limit on CNO,
Geo-antineutrinos (Phys.Lett.687,2010),
pp neutrinos
Supernovae neutrinos
and possibly actual CNO measure in the future
```

In principle full solar v-spectroscopy in one experiment !

all requiring ultra-low background especially the solar measurements → the big challenge of the experiment! → turned into an incredible success!!

Results made possible by

- a) Ultra-low background
- b) Thorough calibration of the detector with internal and external sources
- c) A detailed MC able to reproduce accurately the calibration results
- d) High statistics
- e) Pulse shape discrimination to cope with α background

Extraction of the fluxes through a data-to-model fit *Phase I may 2007 – may 2010 Phase II December 2011 -end of 2016 (still ongoing) Purification in between*

	Radio-Isotope		Concentration or Flux		Strategy for Reduction		Final in	May
The	Name	Source	Typical	Required	Hardware	Software	phase I	2010
saga \rightarrow the quest for	μ	cosmic	~ 200 s ⁻¹ m ⁻² @ sea level	<10 ⁻¹⁰ s ⁻¹ m ⁻²	underground water detector	Cerenkov PS analysis	<10 ⁻¹⁰ eff. > 0.99992	
the ultimate	γ	rock			water	fid. vol.	negligible	
purity	γ	PMTs, SSS			buffer	fid. vol.	negligible	
	¹⁴ C	intrinsic PC	~10 ⁻¹² g/g	~10 ⁻¹⁸ g/g	selection	threshold	2.7 x10 ^{-18 14} C/ ¹² C	
	238U 232Th	dust, metallic	10 ⁻⁵ -10 ⁻⁶ g/g	<10 ⁻¹⁶ g/g	distillation, W.E., filtration, mat. selection, cleanliness	tagging, α/β	$5.35 \pm 0.5 \times 10^{-18}$ $3.8 \pm 0.8 \times 10^{-18}$ g/g	20 times better than the design value
	7Be	cosmogenic	~3 10 ⁻² Bq/t	<10 ⁻⁶ Bq/t	distillation		not seen	
	⁴⁰ K	dust, PPO	~2. 10 ⁻⁶ g/g (dust)	<10 ⁻¹⁸ g/g	distillation,W.E.		not seen	
	²¹⁰ Po	surface cont. from ²²² Rn		<1 c/d/t	distillation, W.E., filtration, cleanliness	fit	May '07: 70 c/d/t Jan '10: ~1 c/d/t	Bismuth-210 41.0±1.5±2.3 c/d/100t
	²²² Rn	emanation from materials, rock	10 Bq/l air, water 100-1000 Bq rock	<10 cpd 100 t	N ₂ stripping cleanliness	tagging, α/β	<1 cpd 100 t	
	³⁹ Ar	air, cosmogenic	17 mBq/m ³ (air)	< 1 cpd 100 t	N ₂ stripping	fit	<< ⁸⁵ Kr	
	⁸⁵ Kr	air, nuclear weapons	- 1 Bq/m ³ (air)	< 1 cpd 100 t	N ₂ stripping	fit	30 ± 5 cpd/100 t	

Low energy range (0.14-2 MeV) calibration



@ MC tuned on γ source results



- @ Determination of Light yield and of the Birks parameter k_B
 L.Y. → obtained from the γ calibration sources with MC: ~ 500 p.e./MeV
 > left as free parameter in the total fit in the analytical approach
- @ Precision of the energy scale global determination: max deviation 1.5%

@ Fiducial volume uncertainty: $\left| \begin{array}{c} +0.5 \\ -1.3 \end{array} \right|^{+0.5}$ (1 σ) (radon sources)



G. Ranucci INFN Milano (Italy) ICPPA 2017 Moscow 4-10-2017



G. Ranucci INFN Milano (Italy) ICPPA 2017 Moscow 4-10-2017



⁷Be (0.862 MeV) solar flux from Borexino



•Search for a day night effect:

•not expected for ⁷Be in the LMA-MSW model

•Large effect expected in the "LOW" solution (excluded by solar exp+Kamland)

 $A_{DN} = \frac{N - D}{(N + D)/2} = 0.001 \pm 0.012 \,(stat) \pm 0.007 (sys)$

• v_{e} survival probability 0.51 +- 0.07 @0.862MeV

 $4.47(1\pm0.07)\times10^9$ $cm^{-2}s^{-1}$

G. Bellini et al., Borexino Collaboration, Phys. Rev. Lett. 107 (2011) 141362.

G. Bellini et al., Borexino Collaboration, Phys. Lett. B707 (2012) 22.

G. Bellini et al., Borexino Collaboration, arXiv:1308.0443 (2013).

pep (1.44 MeV) flux measurement and CNO limit in Borexino



Best limit on CNO so far....

⁸B with lower threshold at 3 MeV (488 live days)

Phase I results ⁸B

Background in the 3.0-16.5 MeV energy range

Cosmic Muons

External background

- High energy gamma's from neutron captures
- ✓ ²⁰⁸TI and ²¹⁴Bi from radon emanation from nylon vessel Cosmogenic isotopes
- ✓ ²¹⁴Bi and ²⁰⁸TI from ²³⁸U and ²³²Th bulk contamination

Cuts

- •@Muon cut + 2 mms dead time to reject induced **neutrons** (240 µs)
- @ Fiducial volume
- •@Muon induced radioactive nuclides: 6.5 s veto after each crossing muon (~30% dead time)-¹⁰C (τ =27.8 s) tagged with the **Three**fold coincidence with the μ parent and the neutron capture)-¹¹Be (τ =19.9 s) statistically subtracted
- •@²¹⁴Bi-²¹⁴Po coincidences rejected (τ =237 µs-²²²Rn daughter)
- •@²⁰⁸Tl from ²¹²Bi-²¹²Po (B.R.64%- τ =431ns) w β evaluate the ²⁰⁸Tl production via



α

α

212Po

BR=36%

208TI

208Pb





Borexino program at a glance

Totally unprecedented accomplishment in the solar neutrino arena: almost complete **precision** solar v spectroscopy by a single experiment: Borexino alone validates the LMA MSW oscillation paradigm

"Although historically by measuring Δm_{21}^2 KamLAND has uniquely selected the LMA solution, now the solar neutrino experiments alone can do this due to new measurements by Borexino, which validated the solution at low energies, and due to higher accuracy of other results." M. Maltoni and A.Yu. Smirnov EPJA 52, 87 2016



- ➢ First specific solar ⁷Be-∨ measurement
- > ⁷Be-v day-night asymmetry
- Low-threshold ⁸B-ν
- First pep-v detection
- **Best upper limit on CNO-v**
- ➢ ⁷Be-v seasonal modulation
- > Muon seasonal variation
- > Limits on rare processes
- > Neutrons and other cosmogenics

Perspectives for phase II at its beginning

Further possible achievements based on improved **backgrounds** after the purification



Improved ⁷**Be**, ⁸**B**, and pep \rightarrow More stringent test of the profile of the Pee survival probability \rightarrow sub-leading effect in addition to MSW, new physics, NSI?

Improved ⁷Be and ⁸B \rightarrow some hint about metallicity?

CNO is the ideal metallicity discriminator \rightarrow ²¹⁰Bi is the challenge - more purification ?

Results of the standard spectral fit for pp with initial phase



G. Ranucci INFN Milano (Italy) ICPPA 2017 Moscow 4-10-2017

First real-time measurement of ppneutrino flux (~11% precision) pp = 144 ± 13 (stat) ± 10 (syst) cpd/100 t compared to expected (MSW/LMA,HM) 131±2 cpd/100 t



Borexino measured electron neutrino survival probability for 4 different nuclear reactions after the pp measurement



ICPPA 2017 Moscow 4-10-2017 G. Ranucci INFN Milano (Italy)

Phase II data simultaneous low energy spectroscopy and evidence of

the pep scattering edge

Released at TAUP@SNOLAB arXiv:1707.09279

More than 5σ evidence for the pep signal



Comparison between Phase I and Phase II results

	Phase I	Phase II	Uncertainty reduction <u>Phase II</u> Phase I
рр	144 ± 13±10	134 ± 10 ⁺⁶ ₋₁₀	0.78
⁷ Be(862KeV)	46.0 ± 1.5 ^{+1.6} -1.5	46.3 ± 1.1 ^{+0.4} -0.7	0.57
рер	3.1 ± 0.6 ± 0.3	(HZ) 2.43 \pm 0.36 ^{+0.15} -0.22 (LZ) 2.65 \pm 0.36 ^{+0.15} -0.24	0.61

Beginning of the precision era in the study of low energy solar neutrinos ⁷Be precision 2.7%

LE and HE Ranges

New ⁸B released at 10 years of Borexino: Workshop RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN NEUTRINO PHYSICS AND ASTROPHYSICS

Splitting the sample at 2950 npe (> 5 MeV): no natural radioactivity expected above this threshold



Systematic Errors and ResultsLEHELE+HESource σ σ Active mass2.02.0

ACUVE MIDDB	2.0	2.0	2.0
Energy scale	0.5	4.9	1.7
z-cut	0.7	0.0	0.4
Live time	0.05	0.05	0.05
Scintillator density	0.5	0.5	0.5
Total [%]	2.2	5.3	2.7

In addition we have tested:

pdf radial distortion: ±3%

Emanation vessel shift: ±1%

- Response functions for the emanation component generated at 6 cm from the vessel (instead of 1 cm)

Binning dependence

None of these potential systematic sources affected the measured 8B rate outside 1 statistical sigma

$$\begin{split} R_{LE} &= & 0.133^{+0.013}_{-0.013}\,(stat)\,^{+0.003}_{-0.003}\,(syst)\,\,\mathrm{cpd}/100\,\mathrm{t}, \\ R_{HE} &= & 0.087^{+0.08}_{-0.010}\,(stat)\,^{+0.005}_{-0.005}\,(syst)\,\,\mathrm{cpd}/100\,\mathrm{t}, \\ R_{LE+HE} &= & 0.220^{+0.015}_{-0.016}\,(stat)\,^{+0.006}_{-0.006}\,(syst)\,\,\mathrm{cpd}/100\,\mathrm{t}. \end{split}$$

Expected rate in the LE+HE range: 0.211± 0.025 cpd/100 t Assuming B16(G98) SSM and MSW+LMA

Equivalent unoscillated flux

13

	SuperKamiokande	2.345 ±0.014 ±0.036 x 10 ⁶ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹		
BX 2010		2.4 ±0.4 x10 ⁶ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹		
This measurement		2.55 ±0.18 ±0.07 x 10 ⁶ cm ⁻² s ⁻¹		
G. Ranucci INFN Milano (Italy) ICPPA 2017 Moscow 4-10-2017				

26

35

The global oscillation picture: survival probability of the electron neutrinos contrasted with the Borexino data points as of today



FROM BOREXINO ALONE VALIDATION OF THE LMA-MSW OSCILLATION SOLUTION OVER THE FULL SOLAR NEUTRINO SPECTRUM

Reinforced by the improved precision of the phase II data

⁷Be 2.7%

Simultaneous low energy spectroscopy



"Although historically by measuring ∆m²₂₁ KamLAND has uniquely selected the LMA solution, now the solar neutrino experiments alone can do this due to new measurements by Borexino, which validated the solution at low energies, and due to higher accuracy of other results." M. Maltoni and A.Yu. Smirnov

EPJA 52, 87 2016

 P_{ee} curve (magenta band) as expected from v oscillation+Matter effect (LMA-MSW)

$$A^{^{7}Be}{}_{DN} = \frac{D - N}{(N + D)/2} = (-0.1 \pm 1.2 \pm 0.7)\%$$

Borexino Coll., Phys. Lett. B707 (2012) 22.

Day-Night asymmetry of ⁷Be neutrinos consistent with 0 in agreement with the LMA-MSW expectation

Closing on the pp chain burning mechanism experimental investigation

The complete spectroscopy from **pp to** ⁸**B** represents the first and unique determination of the pp cycle \rightarrow **final crowing of the experimental quest for the burning mechanism fueling the Sun!**

Quantitative probe
of the pp solar fusion
long advocated by
John Bahcall
$$R = \frac{Rate({}^{3}He + {}^{3}He)}{Rate({}^{3}He + {}^{4}He)}$$
 $R = \frac{2 \Phi({}^{7}Be)}{\Phi(pp) - \Phi({}^{7}Be)}$ Expected values:
 $R = 0.180 \pm 0.011$ HZ
 $R = 0.161 \pm 0.010$ LZ Measured value:
 $arXiv:1707.09279$ $R = 0.18 \pm 0.02$ Borexino closes and completes a more than
one century long scientific adventure

Can the current data discriminate between high and low metallicity ?



New pp, ⁷Be, pep results of the analysis of Phase II data

	Borexino results cpd/100t	expected HZ cpd/100t	expected LZ cpd/100t
рр	134 ± 10 ⁺⁶ ₋₁₀	131.0 ± 2.4	132.1 ± 2.4
⁷ Be(862+384 KeV)	48.3 ± 1.1 ^{+0.4} _{-0.7}	47.8 ± 2.9	43.7 ± 2.6
pep (HZ)	2.43 ± 0.36 ^{+0.15} -0.22	2.74 ± 0.05	2.78 ± 0.05
pep (LZ)	2.65 ± 0.36 ^{+0.15} -0.24	2.74 ± 0.05	2.78 ± 0.05
	Borexino results Flux (cm ⁻² s ⁻¹)	expected HZ Flux (cm ⁻² s ⁻¹)	expected LZ Flux (cm ⁻² s ⁻¹)
рр	(6.1 ± 0.5 ^{+0.3} _{-0.5}) 10 ¹⁰	5.98 (1± 0.006) 10 ¹⁰	6.03 (1± 0.005) 10 ¹⁰
⁷ Be(862+384 KeV)	(4.99±0.13 ^{+0.07} -0.10)10 ⁹	4.93 (1± 0.06) 10 9	4.50 (1± 0.06) 10 ⁹
pep (HZ)	(1.27 ± 0.19 ^{+0.08} -0.12) 10 ⁸	1.44 (1± 0.009) 10 ⁸	1.46 (1± 0.009) 10 ⁸
pep <mark>(</mark> LZ)	(1.39 ± 0.19 ^{+0.08} -0.13) 10 ⁸	1.44 (1± 0.009) 10 ⁸	1.46 (1± 0.009) 10 ⁸

The latest Borexino data though cannot disentangle between the two models point (⁷Be, ⁸B) to a slight preference for the HZ p-value for HZ-SSM 0.998 p-value for the LZ-SSM 0.362

arXiv:1709.00756

Further recent accomplishments



	Borexino result	Expected HZ	Expected LZ	Previous limit (set by Borexino Phase I) [,]
CNO ν	< 8.1 95%C.L cpd/100t	4.91 +-0.56 cpd/100t	3.62 +- 0.37 cpd/100t	7.9 cpd/100t
L				arXiv:1/07.09279

Latest Borexino geoneutrino results





 $[\]blacktriangleright$ Quest for the CNO-v flux – only possible in BX 41

Conclusions

- ✓ Unprecedented purity even better in phase II
- ✓ Full solar neutrino spectroscopy in only one experiment fueling mechanism of the Sun through the pp chain completely investigated by Borexino
- ✓ Validation at of the MSW-LMA v oscillation solution by Borexino alone over the entire solar neutrino spectrum
- ✓ Neat and clean geo-v signal (not covered here)
- ✓ The extremely challenging quest of for the CNO cycle → ultimate solar neutrino frontier for Borexino
- ✓ The sterile search through artificial anti-neutrino source SOX will be the other branch of the future Borexino program